


MEMORANDUM

To: Board of Education
From: Phillip Penn, Chief Financial Officer 
Date: March 19, 2020
Re: Additional data regarding rates of pay for part time staff

There was a request made at the March 16 Finance & Operations subcommittee meeting for some additional information regarding the part time pay proposals that have circulated over the last several weeks.

1. Can you provide the total number of staff by class (substitutes, paras, bus monitors, part timers) who will be affected by the proposal, as well as the individual changes (for instance, a part time staff's weekly pay would change from \$\$\$\$ to \$\$\$\$). You may have to average in some classes like FT paras.

We have a pool of approximately 245 potential substitute teachers (\$75/day); we have on average 119 openings per day. We also have 149 part-time paraprofessionals (\$12.00/hr); 26 bus monitors (\$35.50 to \$63.50/day); 46 student workers (\$11.00/hr); 8 lunch aides (\$11/hr); 60 non-certified instructors (\$15.00/hr); and approximately 67 full-time paras that work additional hours (\$14.00/hr).

Nearly all of the part-time paraprofessionals work either 15 hours a week or 19.5 hours a week. Increasing their hourly pay to \$16.67 from \$12.00 would increase their weekly pay by \$70.05 or \$91.07, respectively. The lunch aides work between 7.5 and 13.75 hours per week; the students work 1.5 hours per week.

2. Did you factor in the savings realized by paras replacing substitutes (\$50 for paras as opposed to \$100 per substitute)? If not, can you?

Compared to our current practice, there is no savings from using paras to cover a class, since they're only used when a sub can't be found. Any differentiated pay generates additional cost:

Current Practice	Admin Proposal	Board Member Proposal
If no sub found, para covers the classroom. No differentiated pay. Additional cost: \$0	If no sub found, para covers the classroom. \$3/hr x 6.75 hours. Additional cost: \$20.25	If no sub found, para covers the classroom. Additional \$50/day Additional cost: \$50

3. Please provide the underlying calculations used to reach the conclusions you reported.

Administration Proposal	Annual Cost	Cost 4/1/2020 - 6/30/2020	Board Member Proposal	Annual Cost	Cost 4/1/2020 - 6/30/2020
Increase pay rate for substitute teachers to \$95 per day.	\$298,000	\$59,600	Increase pay rate for substitute teachers to \$100 per day.	\$373,000	\$74,600
Increase pay rate per hour by \$3 for paraprofessionals covering a classroom for a full day.	\$100,500	\$20,100	Increase pay rate by \$50 per day for paraprofessionals cover a classroom.	\$257,700	\$51,500
Change pay rate for bus monitors to \$12 per hour with a daily minimum of \$60.	\$22,000	\$4,400	Change pay rate for bus monitors to \$12 per hour with a daily minimum of \$65.	\$26,300	\$5,260
No administration proposal	<u>\$0</u>	<u>\$0</u>	Increase pay rate for part-time staff earning \$12.00 per hour to \$16.67 per hour, with a daily minimum of \$65.	<u>\$454,000</u>	<u>\$90,800</u>
Totals	\$420,500	\$84,100		\$1,111,000	\$222,160

From the memo of March 2, we know we attempt to fill an average of 119 vacancies a day, with a fill rate of 57%. Out of the 119 per day, 52 are filled and 67 are unfilled and must be covered by someone else in the building.

- Increasing the daily rate for subs to the top of the market should increase the fill rate substantially. An improvement to a 70% fill rate seemed reasonable.
- $119 \text{ absences} \times 70\% \text{ fill rate} \times 180 \text{ days} \times (\$95 \text{ new rate} - \$75 \text{ old rate}) = \$299,880$. We have approximately 20% of our school days left from April to June. $\$299,880 \times 20\% = \$59,976$.

If the fill rate increases to 70%, the unfilled rate drops to 30%. Building principals in the K-8 schools reported that paras cover the classroom approximately 80% of the time. Therefore, for the para differential pay:

- $119 \text{ absences} \times 30\% \text{ unfilled rate} \times 80\% \text{ para usage} \times 180 \text{ days} (\$3.00 \times 6.5 \text{ hours/day}) = \$100,246$. For the remainder of the school year, $\$100,246 \times 20\% = \$20,049$.

The same formula applied to a \$0/day differential yields:

- $119 \text{ absences} \times 30\% \text{ unfilled rate} \times 80\% \text{ para usage} \times 180 \text{ days} \times \$50/\text{day} = \$257,040$. For the remainder of the school year, $\$257,040 = \$51,408$.

Because the bus monitors are paid different rates on a daily basis, each pay tier had to be calculated separately. The basic formula structure is # of drivers x 180 days x pay differential per day. Using the actual staffing level from the March 6 payroll:

# Drivers	Current Rate	New Rate	# of Days	Total	# Drivers	Current Rate	New Rate	# of Days	Total
6.5	\$63.50	\$66.00	180	\$2,925	6.5	\$63.50	\$66.00	180	\$2,925
6.5	\$58.50	\$60.00	180	\$1,755	6.5	\$58.50	\$65.00	180	\$7,605
3.0	\$54.50	\$60.00	180	\$2,970	3.0	\$54.50	\$65.00	180	\$5,670
3.0	\$49.50	\$60.00	180	\$5,670	3.0	\$49.50	\$65.00	180	\$8,370
1.5	\$40.50	\$60.00	180	\$5,265	1.5	\$40.50	\$65.00	180	\$6,615
1.0	\$35.50	\$60.00	180	<u>\$4,410</u>	1.0	\$35.50	\$65.00	180	<u>\$5,310</u>
				\$22,995					\$36,495

Finally, from our March 6 payroll run, we paid out \$32,409 to employees earning \$12 per hour. The March 6 payroll covered five school days and reflected 2,701 hours worked, or \$6,482 and 540.2 hours per day. An increase from \$12.00 per hour to \$16.67 per hour yields the following increase in cost:

- $540.2 \text{ hours/day} \times 180 \text{ days} \times (\$16.67 \text{ new rate per hour} - \$12.00 \text{ old rate per hour}) = \$454,092$. For the remainder of the 2019-20 year the cost is $\$454,092 \times 20\% = \$90,818$.


However, a \$65 per day minimum further increases that annual cost. During the same March 6 payroll period 149 part-time paraprofessionals worked. If each of the paraprofessionals received \$65 per day and worked in each payroll period, the annual cost would increase as follows:

- $(149 \text{ paras} \times \$65 \text{ per day} \times 180 \text{ days}) - (\$6,482 \times 180) = \$576,540$.

Additional attachments:

- February 27, 2020 memo
- March 2, 2020 memo
- Current rates of pay for part timers dated January 1, 2020
- March 9, 2020 Board member proposed resolutions
- March 13, 2020 memo

MEMORANDUM

To: Finance and Operations Committee, Board of Education
From: Phillip Penn, Chief Financial Officer 
Date: February 27, 2020
Re: Rates of pay

I'd like to propose a handful of fixes to some systemic issues we have around our pay rates.

Specifically, I would recommend moving our substitute teacher pay rate from the bottom of the market (\$75 per day) to near the top (either \$95 or \$100), to ensure we're competitive vs. surrounding towns and generating an acceptable talent pool (see comparison below).


I further think we should offer a pay differential of \$3/hour to any paraprofessional that covers a classroom for a full day. The current contract makes it fairly clear that paras are to be used to cover classrooms only on an emergency basis, and not more than one day a week. Given the poor fill rate we have with our substitute teachers, we are aware that several paras have covered classrooms on a more extended basis. This proposal would provide differentiated pay to the para taking on responsibilities beyond the scope of their normal role.

Lastly, I would recommend moving our bus monitors to \$12 per hour, with a guaranteed daily minimum of \$60 per day. The current structure is a flat daily rate ranging from \$35.50 to \$63.50, depending on the number of bus runs the employee covers. The minimum wage will move to \$12 later this year, and we have some concerns about how our per-day compensation structure is impacting some individuals. To be clear, the new rate will be earned from the time they leave the yard on a run to when they return. This would not cover commuting time on the shuttle buses. Currently, we are paying First Student for substitute bus monitors (10-15 subs per day at about \$30 an hour) because our own pay rates are out of synch with the market. Thus, we are likely to save money by increasing the pay to our internal staff.

I look forward to your thoughts.

District	Current Sub Rate Per Day
N. Branford	75
Guilford	89
Milford	90
Bethany	90
Madison	90
Stratford	90
Trumbull	100
Naugatuck	<u>100</u>
Avg.	90.5

MEMORANDUM

To: Finance and Operations Committee, Board of Education
From: Phillip Penn, Chief Financial Officer 
Date: March 2, 2020
Re: Additional data regarding rates of pay

Please see below answers to questions regarding the rate of pay proposals for tonight's meeting:

Substitutes

1. On average, how many do we use daily?

On average, we're able to fill 52 absences.

2. How many do we need daily?

On average there are 119 absences that need coverage.

	Fill				School
	Needed	Filled	Unfilled	Fill Rate	Days
September	1,492	816	675	45.2%	19
October	2,532	1,140	1,389	54.9%	21
November	2,322	943	1,374	59.2%	18
December	1,975	754	1,217	61.6%	15
January	2,502	1,028	1,465	58.6%	20
February	<u>1,977</u>	<u>830</u>	<u>1,143</u>	<u>57.8%</u>	<u>15</u>
	12,800	5,511	7,263	56.7%	108

Average # of absences: 119

Average # filled: 52

Average # unfilled: 67

3. How many hours per day do they work?

6.5 hours per day. At the current daily rate, the pay is \$11.54 per hour. At the proposed daily rate (\$95), that would move to \$14.62 per hour.

Paras

1. How many hours a day do the FT paras work?

Per the current contract, they work 6.5 hours a day.

2. How many paras are we having cover classrooms for a full day?

The elementary principals indicated that paras are asked to cover a classroom 80-90% of the time there's a teacher absence and no sub. Alternatively, it's a mix of teachers with extra prep periods, instructional coaches, Special Ed teachers, and the Principals themselves. With on average 67 unfilled absences per day, and assuming that two thirds of those are at the K-8 level, we're asking about 35 paras to cover a classroom per day.

What is the total additional costs for the recommendations?

- If the fill rate improved to 70% from the current level of 57%, the full-year impact of increasing the substitute pay rate would be about \$298,000. For April 1 through the remainder of the 2019-20 school year, it would be approximately \$59,600.
- With more available subs, the number of paras covering a classroom per day should drop by about 20%, to 28 per day. The cost of the pay differential would be \$100,500 per year, and \$20,100 from April 1 through the end of the 2019-20 school year.
- The impact of the change to the bus monitor pay structure is approximately \$22,000 per year, and \$4,400 from April through the end of the 2019-20 school year.

**RATE OF PAY for Part-Timers
Updated January 1, 2020**

Instructional Support- Certified Teacher: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Tutor • Pre-K instructional support • Any teacher under the NHFT contract that works beyond their day Must attach student attendance sheets with time sheets	Pay Code 700	\$32.00
Tutor - Not Certified BA or better : <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Tutor • Pre-K instructional support Must attach student attendance sheets with time sheets	704	\$22.50
Non-Degreed Instructor: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Business Managers • Skilled Workers - Must have an attach an Associates Degree, 60 credits or a Business Certificate to receive this rate of pay. Student attendance sheet must be provided with timesheet. Must be teaching their own group of students. (except Business Manager) 	705	\$15.00
Full Time UNION Para Professionals Part Time hours Rate	716	\$14.50
Parents/Community Aide Dean – Non Instructional	720	\$12.00
PART TIME Clerical Non Union	725	\$11.00
FT Administrative Assistants - 884 – PT Rate can only work a maximum of 5 hours a week – one hour a day.	723	Varies
Student (presently in High school), Lunch Aide	730	\$11.00
SUMMER RATES	702 707	Certified Teacher - \$32.00 Non-Certified - \$17.50

Revised 1/1/2020

Resolutions FY 2020-2021

March 9, 2020

Resolution #1 raises for Part Time Instructional Staff

The NHPS CFO proposed “a handful of fixes to some systemic issues we have around our pay rates” to allow for better competition with surrounding towns for qualified staffers as well as general fairness to some of our lowest employees. The CFO proposed raising the pay rates for substitutes, paras and bus monitors. He also suggested changing the pay rates for paras and bus monitors.

Background Information

Minimum Wage	Living Wage – 1 Adult			
	0 Children	1 Child	2 Children	3 Children
\$11.00 on October 1, 2019	\$13.74	\$29.36	\$33.99	\$41.21
\$12.00 on September 1, 2020				
\$13.00 on August 1, 2021				
\$14.00 on July 1, 2022				
\$15.00 on June 1, 2023				

Substitute teachers

Currently, substitute teachers make \$75 per day. The current hourly rate at 6.5 hours is \$11.54.

Full time Paras

Currently, fulltime paras are being asked to cover classrooms when teachers are absent. The CFO has proposed that a pay differential of \$3 per hour should be given to paras who are asked to cover classrooms.

Bus Monitors

Currently, bus monitors are paid a flat daily rate of between \$35.50 to \$63.50 depending on the number of bus runs the employee covers. The CFO recommends that we move to a \$12 per hour wage with a guaranteed minimum of \$60 per day.

Part Time Paras and Parent Advocates


No recommendation from the CFO. Currently these workers earn \$12.00 an hour for 19.5 hours per week (the same rate for over 4 years) and are not represented by a union. The currently earn about \$46.80 per day.

Motion

1. **Substitute teachers - Increasing the substitute teacher pay rate from \$75 per day (the bottom of the market) to \$100 per day (the top of the market) [hourly rate of \$15.38]**
2. **Full Time Paras - add a \$3 per hour pay differential when a para is asked to cover a classroom.**
3. **Bus Monitors – change the pay structure to pay a minimum wage of \$12 per hour with guaranteed minimum of \$65 per pay**
4. **Part Time Paras and Parent Advocates – raise the minimum wage to \$16.66, with a guaranteed \$65 per day (the same as the bus monitors).**

*** It should be noted that in several years the minimum wage will be \$15.00 per hour, and most of these wages will have to rise each year for the next 4 years.*

MEMORANDUM

To: Finance and Operations Committee, Board of Education
 From: Phillip Penn, Chief Financial Officer 
 Date: March 13, 2020
 Re: Additional data regarding rates of pay per Board member proposal

The table below summarizes the difference in cost between the proposals as presented by management and as presented by one of the Board members at the March 9, 2020 BOE meeting:

Administration Proposal	Annual Cost	Cost	Board Member Proposal	Annual Cost	Cost
		4/1/2020 - 6/30/2020			4/1/2020 - 6/30/2020
Increase pay rate for substitute teachers to \$95 per day.	\$298,000	\$59,600	Increase pay rate for substitute teachers to \$100 per day.	\$373,000	\$74,600
Increase pay rate per hour by \$3 for paraprofessionals covering a classroom for a full day.	\$100,500	\$20,100	Increase pay rate by \$50 per day for paraprofessionals cover a classroom.	\$257,700	\$51,500
Change pay rate for bus monitors to \$12 per hour with a daily minimum of \$60.	\$22,000	\$4,400	Change pay rate for bus monitors to \$12 per hour with a daily minimum of \$65.	\$26,300	\$5,260
No administration proposal	<u>\$0</u>	<u>\$0</u>	Increase pay rate for part-time staff earning \$12.00 per hour to \$16.67 per hour, with a daily minimum of \$65.	<u>\$454,000</u>	<u>\$90,800</u>
Totals	\$420,500	\$84,100		\$1,111,000	\$222,160



QUOTE CONFIRMATION

DEAR SABINA SITARU,

Thank you for considering CDW•G for your computing needs. The details of your quote are below. [Click here](#) to convert your quote to an order.

QUOTE #	QUOTE DATE	QUOTE REFERENCE	CUSTOMER #	GRAND TOTAL
LHTF964	3/19/2020	90186553C	8003459	\$1,534,065.00

QUOTE DETAILS				
ITEM	QTY	CDW#	UNIT PRICE	EXT. PRICE
Google Chrome Management Console License - Education Mfg. Part#: CROSSWDISEDU UNSPSC: 43232804 Electronic distribution - NO MEDIA Contract: PEPPM 2018 Catalog Agreement (PEPPM2018)	6500	3577022	\$25.00	\$162,500.00
Lenovo 100e Chromebook MTK8173C 11.6" 4GB RAM 32GB Chrome OS Mfg. Part#: 81QB0000US UNSPSC: 43211503 Contract: PEPPM 2018 Catalog Agreement (PEPPM2018)	6500	5437831	\$175.00	\$1,137,500.00
SFW 3Y SPECIAL BID CHROMEBOOK Mfg. Part#: CDWSPCCHMNHSTESP36D Electronic distribution - NO MEDIA Contract: PEPPM 2018 Catalog Agreement (PEPPM2018)	6500	5853118	\$36.01	\$234,065.00

PURCHASER BILLING INFO	SUBTOTAL	\$1,534,065.00
Billing Address: NEW HAVEN PUBLIC SCHOOLS DEPT OF EDUCATION 54 MEADOW ST NEW HAVEN, CT 06519-1783 Phone: (203) 787-8900 Payment Terms: NET 30 Days-Govt/Ed	SHIPPING	\$0.00
	SALES TAX	\$0.00
	GRAND TOTAL	\$1,534,065.00
	DELIVER TO Shipping Address: NEW HAVEN PUBLIC SCHOOLS DEPT OF EDUCATION 54 MEADOW ST NEW HAVEN, CT 06519-1783 Phone: (203) 787-8900 Shipping Method: UPS Ground (2- 3 Day)	Please remit payments to: CDW Government 75 Remittance Drive Suite 1515 Chicago, IL 60675-1515

Need Assistance? CDW•G SALES CONTACT INFORMATION		
	Vincent Mulvihill	(866) 773-7348 vinny@cdwg.com

This quote is subject to CDW's Terms and Conditions of Sales and Service Projects at <http://www.cdw.com/content/terms-conditions/product-sales.aspx>
 For more information, contact a CDW account manager
 © 2020 CDW•G LLC, 200 N. Milwaukee Avenue, Vernon Hills, IL 60061 | 800.808.4239